A GUIDE TO PROCEDURES FOR THE PUBLICATION OF THERMODYNAMIC DATA

LONDON
BUTTERWORTHS
A GUIDE TO PROCEDURES FOR THE PUBLICATION OF THERMODYNAMIC DATA

This guide is to be published in English in *Pure and Applied Chemistry*, *The Journal of Chemical Thermodynamics*, and elsewhere. It will be translated into French, German, Japanese and Russian and published in appropriate journals to reach authors employing those languages. Comments for subsequent revisions will be welcomed and should be addressed to the Chairman of the Project Group;

Prof. Edgar F. Westrum, Jr
Department of Chemistry
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104, USA
At the 1971 Washington, DC meeting of the IUPAC Commission on Thermodynamics and Thermochemistry it was resolved that the following guide should be given the widest publicity to aid in the resolution of some current problems in scientific communication and in the hope that it might stimulate similar action by other organizations concerned with specialized fields of science.

This guide was previously ratified by the All-Union Calorimetry Conference (USSR), the Calorimetry Conference (USA), the Experimental Thermodynamics Conference (UK), the Society of Calorimetry and Thermal Analysis (Japan), and the Société Française des Termiciens (France).

In 1953, the Eighth (US) Calorimetry Conference adopted a resolution providing guidance on minimum publication standards in calorimetry. This resulted in an improvement in the quality of publication, and so led the Calorimetry Conference to revise, extend and publish its recommendations in 1960. A second revision was authorized in 1970, and it was intended that this new version should be submitted to various calorimetry and related conferences, and to the International Union of Pure and Applied Chemistry for suggestions and ratification.

This has been done with the approval of Commission I.2 of IUPAC and the agreed text is hereby presented in accordance with the terms of the resolution cited at the head of this document. The Commission itself has also prescribed recommendations on the publication of thermochemical studies as early as 1934, as has the scientific council on chemical thermodynamics of IONKh of the USSR Academy of Sciences.

INTRODUCTION

This guide is addressed not only to specialists in calorimetry or in the
various aspects of thermodynamics but also to all those who measure and publish thermodynamic quantities as adjuvant aspects of their research endeavours. We would urge all who ever publish thermodynamic values for whatever purpose determined to follow these suggestions so that maximum benefit from their studies will be realized. Journal editors and referees should note that this document embodies a set of consistent, carefully considered criteria for judging the completeness and acceptability of papers reporting thermodynamic quantities. The ultimate needs of the compiler and correlator of such data have been considered also.

**ESSENTIAL INFORMATION**

The highly interdependent nature of thermodynamic data imposes special obligations upon the author of papers reporting the results of thermodynamic investigation. He must give enough information about his experiment to allow readers to appraise the precision and accuracy of his results so they may be properly consolidated within the existing body of data in the literature. Further, as accepted values of physical constants change or as new thermodynamic data for related systems become available, subsequent investigators often can recalculate results if it is clear that they are based on good experiments for which adequate information is presented, however old they may be. For these reasons, an author's prime responsibility is to report his results in a form related as closely to experimentally observed quantities as is practical, with enough experimental details and auxiliary information to characterize the results adequately and to allow critical assessment of the accuracy claimed. For the convenience of the reader, the author may interpret and correlate the primary results as appropriate and present derived results in a form easy to utilize. However, such derived (or secondary) results never should be published at the cost of omitting the primary results on which they are based. Reference may be made to accessible earlier publications for some details.

In addition to the presentation of the data themselves, estimates of the precision indices and probable accuracy of the data should be given by the authors. The various sources of uncertainty should be rigorously described with clear separation of measurement imprecisions, numerical analysis deviations and possible systematic biases. The methods and assumptions for the statistical analyses should be indicated. Possible sources and magnitudes of systematic errors should be identified and enumerated.

Because temperature scales are of such great significance for all thermodynamic measurements the considerations and conversions cited by Rossini and others should be observed. For accurately measured temperatures depending on an International Practical Temperature Scale, the scale used in calibration of the temperature-measuring instrument(s) (e.g. 'IPTS-48 as amended in 1960') and the scale to which the specified temperature values refer (sometimes these two scales are different, e.g. the latter might be IPTS-68) should be stated.

In instances where requisite primary results are too extensive or for other reasons do not merit journal publication in full, the use of auxiliary publication
services may be appropriate. A footnote in the publication indicates how the reader may obtain the adjuvant data.

Apparatus and procedures—A description of the apparatus including details of the reaction container or calorimeter vessel, the controlled environment, and measuring systems such as those for time, temperature, and pressure; the design of calibration heaters and heater lead placement; precautions as to shielding or isolation of calibration circuits; the method of calibration and the sensitivity of the instruments used in these measuring systems such as thermometers, bridges, potentiometers, flowmeters and weighing devices should be given. The history of a particular apparatus which is used in an on-going series of researches should be maintained and documented as to modifications, improvements etc., to the end that should corrections be made necessary by subsequent recalibrations or by revelation of systematic errors or bias, such corrections can be applied to all affected data either by the author or by compilers or reviewers. Information establishing the heat capacity of the calorimeter or the energy equivalent (preferably with traceability to a calibrating or standardizing laboratory), together with details of the observational procedures, the methods of evaluating the corrected temperature increment, methods of analysis of results, and the precision of the measurements should be given. The reliability of the results should be established by the use of recognized reference substances such as the samples likely to be recommended by the IUPAC Sub-committee on Standard Calibration Materials, those provided by the (US) National Bureau of Standards or by VNIIM (USSR), those authorized by the Calorimetry Conference for thermophysical or thermo-chemical measurements or those systems generally recognized as standard for mixtures, e.g. the solubility of oxygen in water at 1 atm and 298.15 K for gas solubility, hexane + cyclohexane for enthalpy increments on mixing, and benzene + cyclohexane for volume increments on mixing. Determination of the same quantity by two or more independent methods is often an advisable alternative method for detection of systematic error.

Materials—The source of and/or method of preparation for all materials used, including calibration, reference and auxiliary substances; experimental values for analyses and pertinent physical properties of materials, the criteria of characterization and purity, as well as the method, temperature, time interval etc. of storing samples and preparing them for measurements should be stated whenever this is important. The density used in reduction of weighing to mass, and special procedures such as for dealing with partially filled ampoules, should be specified. For studies made on solutions, the source, preparation and quality of the solvent should always be included, as should information as to dissolved gases (carbon dioxide, air etc.) whenever these impurities may influence the results. For all thermochemical studies, the methods and results of all analytical investigations on the initial and/or final system should be presented, including tests for incomplete reaction, side reactions, evaporation losses of components from mixtures, corrosion of apparatus etc. These considerations as well as possible dialysis of compounds prior to actual reaction, buffers employed etc. may be especially important in biothermodynamic studies.

Symbols, terminology, units—Authors are encouraged to follow as closely
as possible the recommendations of the International System (SI) of units and the symbols and nomenclature approved by IUPAC. In particular, authors are urged (a) to use the recommended name for each physical quantity and the preferred symbol, (b) to use the internationally accepted symbols for units, (c) to use SI units, and (d) to adhere, particularly in the labels of columns or rows in tables and in the labels of the axes of graphs, to the implications of the convention: physical quantity = number × unit; for example, by the use of $S/(JK^{-1} \text{ mol}^{-1})$ as a label for a series of numbers rather than $'S'$ (with or without a statement somewhere as to what the units are), $'S, \{\text{J/K mol}\}'$, $'S J/(\text{K mol})'$, and (e) to functional expressions such as $S^\circ (\text{H}_2\text{O}, \text{g}, 298 \text{ K})$ rather than expressions like $S_{298,\text{H}_2\text{O}}$. (Those authors who elect to use non-SI units should define them in terms of SI units. This might be done, for example, by means of such a footnote as: 'Throughout this paper $\text{cal}_h = 4.184 \text{ J}$, Torr = $(101.325/760) \text{ kPa}$ and $\AA = 0.1 \text{ nm}$'.)

Mode of presentation of results—Although a table giving the appropriate independent and dependent variables is often the best form of presentation in that it permits recovery of the primary results, circumstances arise where especially for a great many determinations the same end may be achieved, for example, by the presentation of an equation representing the temperature dependence of the measured quantity and a deviation plot showing the individual points. This procedure saves space, promotes clarity and in many instances can be sensitive enough to permit full recovery of individual results without a table.

Occasionally, as in combustion calorimetry, each set of replicate measurements can be acceptably recorded as only the mean value, the magnitude and definition of its precision index, and the number of individual measurements made. For the precision indices on thermochemical data, the conventions suggested by Rossini are recommended.

Occasionally, tabulation of high-temperature thermodynamic functions is given by empirical equations which, instead of being in predetermined form and number of disposable parameters, are derived to fit the enthalpy, vapour-pressure, or other data within their precision at every temperature of measurement. This not only provides ready analytical interpolation, differentiation or integration (as by a computer), but can save the journal space of longer-than-abbreviated tables when this is an issue. It is obviously not expedient, of course, when the given property function shows major lack of monotonic behaviour. Graphical and analytical representation of the primary results or secondary results are occasionally worthwhile for the convenience of the reader, but are not generally a satisfactory substitute for tabular presentation of accurate experimental results. Extensive tabulations of secondary values (e.g. smoothed values at rounded temperatures) should be so designed with values reported at temperatures (or pressures etc.) so spaced that no serious loss of accuracy will result by using an interpolation formula equivalent to five-place Lagrangian interpolation. In particular, a sufficient number of digits should be retained to make such interpolation feasible.

It is not practicable to give detailed recommendations for presenting the results of all types of thermodynamic investigations. However, the following paragraphs do provide recommendations for some important kinds of
PUBLICATION OF THERMODYNAMIC DATA

thermochemical, thermophysical and equilibrium studies and will serve as
guides for related areas.

PRESENTATION OF THERMOCHEMICAL CALORIMETRIC DATA

Reaction calorimetry—The following experimental quantities should be
included if applicable: energy equivalent of the calorimetric system, mass of
sample and/or mass of product used in determining the amount of reaction,
masses of auxiliary substances, corrected temperature increment (or if
appropriate initial and final temperatures plus heat exchange adjustment),
total observed energy change, ignition energy, chemical and physical
specification of the initial and final states of the reaction, conversion to
'standard' concentrations, correction for side reactions, reduction to
standard states (e.g. the 'Washburn corrections'), temperature of experiments,
final experimental energy (or enthalpy) of reaction and uncertainty interval
(with the chemical reaction to which the result applies precisely specified).
Derived values such as standard enthalpy and standard Gibbs energy of
formation may be provided for the convenience of the reader. Detailed
discussion of procedures is available.\textsuperscript{18,19}

Solution calorimetry—Although most of the considerations and literature
of the previous paragraph apply, additional material to be included would
involve the specification of the temperature of the measurements, appro-
priately specified concentrations of all reactants, solvent, supporting
electrolyte, ionic strength, the precise reaction occurring etc. Thermochemical
studies on solutions should present primary and derived results in sufficient
detail that the actual calorimetric process is clearly discernible. Dilution
corrections to standard states should describe any approximations for
unmixing, e.g. Young's rule\textsuperscript{20} or approximations as to the relative apparent
enthalpy of uncharged solutes such as NH\textsubscript{3}, CO\textsubscript{2} etc. in the solution.
Investigators of thermochemical properties of solutions are urged to
ascertain densities of their solutions to facilitate theoretical comparison.

PRESENTATION OF THERMOPHYSICAL CALORIMETRIC DATA

The following information is important for delineating the temperature
dependence of the thermodynamic (thermophysical) properties of non-
reacting systems and ascertaining the influence of thermal history on
measured properties and evaluating the reliability of the results: A table of
experimental values of heat capacity or enthalpy increment values including
the actual temperature increments used in the measurements (if important
as e.g. in transition, pre-melting or anomalous regions), the chronological
sequence of data where the thermal history may be significant (either
implicitly by chronological presentation or by a general statement), values
of the energy (or enthalpy) increments and temperatures of essentially
isothermal phase changes, and the reliability of the data indicated by an
estimated uncertainty. These primary experimental results may be sup-
plemented, but never supplanted, by a tabulation of smoothed values of
thermodynamic properties at selected temperatures for the convenience of
the reader. Where applicable, such tabulations should include values of the
appropriate heat capacity, the standard entropy ($S^0$), the standard enthalpy increment \(\{H^0(T) - H^0(0)\}\), the standard Gibbs energy functions \(\{\{G^0(T) - H^0(0)\}\}/T\)^2. Frequently these have been tabulated at 5K intervals from 0 to 50 K, at 10 K intervals from 50 to 300 K or slightly higher temperatures, at 100 K intervals at higher temperatures, and at the temperatures of phase transitions. Such details need not be given for all substances but are desiderata for important compounds. Use of auxiliary publication services as mentioned above may be more appropriate as repositories for such tabulations.

Certainly values at the two important reference temperatures, 273.15 and 298.15 K, should be included in the tabulations. Definitive information on procedures is available.

**PRESENTATION OF CALCULATED THERMOPHYSICAL FUNCTIONS**

Because the usefulness of calorimetric data is extended if calculated thermodynamic functions based upon them are provided, recommendations for the presentation of such calculated values are incorporated here. The following information with appropriate sources is needed to characterize the results of statistical thermodynamic calculations: details of the molecular model used, including bond distances and angles, specification of the exact conformation, moments of inertia or rotational constants, symmetry number, complete vibrational assignments, parameters used for calculating contributions of internal rotation, rotational isomerism, anharmonicity, centrifugal distortion etc., the citation (usually by reference) of formulae and special tabulations used, comparison with experimental thermodynamic data.

The functions tabulated should include those indicated in previous sections except that the heat capacity should be \(C_p^0\) or \(C_v^0\) and in addition, values of the standard enthalpy of formation \(\Delta_f H^0\), standard Gibbs energy of formation \(\Delta_f G^0\), and the common logarithm of the equilibrium constant of formation \(\log K_f\) may be published if warranted. The criterion suggested above for the spacing of values is recommended; this corresponds, for example, to 50 K intervals to 300 K, 100 K intervals to 2000 K, 200 K intervals to 3000 K, and 500 K intervals at higher temperatures. Again the values should be given also at the reference temperatures, 273.15 and 298.15 K.

For purposes of smoothness, interpolation and internal consistency, one (but seldom more than one) more digit may be retained than is justified by the absolute accuracy. For calculations on small, rigid molecules, involving anharmonicity, centrifugal stretching, rotation–vibration interaction, Fermi resonance, isotopic composition and any other significant effect, functions may be reported to three decimal digits, e.g.

\[
12.345 \text{ cal K}^{-1} \text{ mol}^{-1} \text{ or } 51.651 \text{ JK}^{-1} \text{ mol}^{-1}
\]

For more approximate calculations, but with agreement with calorimetric values of \(C_p^0\) and \(S^0\) obtained by empirical anharmonicity corrections or other semi-empirical procedure, two decimal digits are appropriate. For calculations to the rigid-rotator, harmonic-oscillator, independent-internal-rotator approximation, only a single decimal digit should be retained.
PUBLICATION OF THERMODYNAMIC DATA

For still more approximate calculations (based on non-definitive calorimetric data, rough incremental calculations etc.) the single decimal digit should be subscripted. e.g.

\[ 12.3 \text{ cal K}^{-1} \text{ mol}^{-1} \text{ or } 51.7 \text{ JK}^{-1} \text{ mol}^{-1}. \]

PRESENTATION OF \( p, V, T \) DATA

Full disclosure of the use and calibration of the pressure gauge including buoyancy, local gravitational acceleration, fluid heads, pressure reference standards and pressure point in the sample. Volumetric measurements should be referred to a calibration standard as, for example, the density of mercury or water, and the effects from combined pressure and temperature should be described. Also, volumetric data presented in mass or molar units should include the values assumed for atomic weights as well as a statement of the corrections applied for impurity in the sample.

Here also, the importance of the presentation of primary results should be observed. Primary results are not the instrument readings but the values of physical properties derived from these instrument readings after the application of all calibration corrections and evaluating equations etc. These experimental values should be reported in full, together with a brief discussion of the application of various corrections and adjustments. The steps necessary to transform experimental values into final results should be made clear. Particularly, methods of smoothing results and of numerical differentiation or integration should be given as well as the sequence in which they are used. The final results should be accompanied by a statement regarding the magnitude of the differences between the smooth and the unsmooth results. Care should be taken to indicate clearly any results of other workers which are included in the preparation of a composite table. The base for tabulating entropy or Gibbs energy of a compressed fluid should be defined in one of the following ways:

\[ \{S(p, T, \text{real}) - S(p, T, \text{ideal})\} \text{ or } \{S(V, T, \text{real}) - S(V, T, \text{ideal})\}. \]

When results are presented in tabular form, the spacing of data should be sufficiently close to permit accurate mapping of the \( p, V, T \) surface. Consistency tests for anomalous trends should be applied whenever possible. A related guideline for the specialized communication of results may be of interest.

The results of thermophysical measurements leading to Joule–Thomson coefficients or \( (\partial H/\partial p)_T \) should include adequate descriptions of apparatus, procedures, calibrations and comparison measurements, as well as procedures for data reduction.

Since more accurate characterization of the pressure scale to increasingly high values is now possible, authors should be scrupulous in indicating the pressure scale involved.

PRESENTATION OF OTHER EQUILIBRIUM MEASUREMENTS

Included in this category are such diverse measurements as vapour
REPORT

pressures, either by equilibrium or effusion techniques; studies of solubility, distribution, dissociation, adsorption or other chemical equilibria, by whatever techniques are applicable; electrochemical measurements etc. Such measurements provide information leading to the standard Gibbs energy increment for a reaction \((\Delta_r G^\circ)\), but care is needed before associating this value with a particular reaction. Here again, details of apparatus, calibration and experimental procedures should be clearly presented, together with preparations of materials, analytical procedures and any special procedures applicable to the problem. Evidence as to attainment of equilibrium should be given. Primary results, as defined in connection with \(p, V, T\) data, should be reported in full, together with results and methods for reduction of results to standard state conditions, including any auxiliary information or equations, such as those from the Debye–Hückel theory of electrolytes. The chosen standard state should be clearly defined, and the final results, such as \(\Delta_r G^\circ\), \(\log K\) or \(\log p\), should be accompanied by an explicit description or statement of the related reaction, process or change in state. The presentation should include a discussion of errors, estimates of other factors, including instrumental and analytical limitations, effects of non-attainment of equilibrium, side reactions, non-ideality corrections etc., to the end that the precision indices for \(\Delta_r G^\circ\) of reaction include such contributions.

Definitive studies on activity or osmotic coefficients should likewise present clear descriptions of apparatus, materials, experimental and computational procedures, together with sufficient primary results to permit verification of derived results. A forthcoming book will discuss procedures in the areas of equilibrium measurement\(^2\). In reporting adsorption studies, the mass of adsorbent used as well as the duration of the experiment are important.

NON-DEFINITIVE DATA

Although this resolution is concerned primarily with precise and accurate data taken by definitive techniques on well-characterized samples it is recognized that survey measurements are often made for technical and/or analytical purposes and these results are submitted for publication. Such values may be of doubtful significance as a basis for theoretical deductions or for incorporation in critical tables of scientific data. Therefore, the foregoing recommendations do not fully apply and presentation of a brief note summarizing the most important values and heralding a more detailed documentary presentation may be appropriate. However, in differential scanning calorimetric measurements, for example, the characterization of the solid phases before and after the experiment, the composition and pressure of the gas phase, the heating rate, the arrangement of the sample in the cell, the extent of baseline drift during the thermal effect and the way it is taken into account should be noted. Additional recommendations for presentation of thermal analysis data have been cited\(^2\).

This document represents the endeavours of the Project Group of Commission 1.2 on Thermodynamics and Thermochemistry of IUPAC.
PUBLICATION OF THERMODYNAMIC DATA

composed of:

V. P. Kolesov (USSR)
M. L. McGlashan (UK)
Jean Rouquerol (France)
Syuzo Seki (Japan)
C. E. Vanderzee (USA)
E. F. Westrum Jr (USA. Chairman)

REFERENCES

2 The All-Union Calorimetry Conference (USSR), The Calorimetry Conference (USA),
The Experimental Thermodynamics Conference (UK), The Society of Calorimetry and
Thermal Analysis (Japan). La Section de Calorimetrie de la Société Française des Termiciens.
The International Conference on Calorimetry and Thermodynamics (meeting in Maine),
and the Colloque International de Thermostromie (meeting in Marseilles).
3 W. Swietoslawski and L. Kafler. 'First Report from the Standing Commission for Thermo-
chemistry'. IUPAC General Secretariat. Paris (1934).
6 For example. National Auxiliary Publications Service of the American Society for Information
7 IUPAC Subcommission on Standard Calibration Materials; personal communications.
DC. 20234: e.g. NBS Standard Reference Material 720 (Sapphire heat capacity standard).
benzoic acid combustion standard 39, No. 736 trishydroxymethylaminomethane (THAM)
for aqueous solution calorimetry.
9 Vsesoyuzny Nauchno-Issledovatel'skii Institut Metrologii (All-Union Scientific Research
Institute for Metrology).
10 Calorimetry Conference standards such as n-heptane, benzoic acid, synthetic sapphire
(aluminium oxide), and copper for heat capacity and/or enthalpy measurements.
14 'Le système International d’Unités (SI)’ International Bureau of Weights and Measures,
15 A convenient source for this is: Manual of Symbols and Terminology for Physicochemical
17 Tables of Lagrangian Interpolation Coefficients. Prepared by the Mathematical Tables
Project, Works Projects Administration of the Federal Works Agency. Columbia University
21 The nomenclature ‘Gibbs energy function’ (and ‘enthalpy function’) for \( (H(T) - H(0))/T \)
have been widely used. They are presently being reconsidered by IUPAC and other inter-
national scientific unions.
147 (November 1958).
REPORT
